

Table of Contents

Introduction	XV
Part I. Moral Dilemmas in Ethical and Legal-Ethical Perspective	1
Chapter 1. Moral Dilemmas as a Matter of Contemporary Ethical Debate (Paweł Skuczyński)	3
1.1. Examples of dilemmas	3
1.1.1. The Trolley Dilemma	3
1.1.2. The Heinz's Dilemma.....	8
1.1.3. The Sophie's Dilemma (aka The Sophie's Choice)	12
1.1.4. The Sartre's Student's Dilemma	15
1.2. The concept of moral dilemmas.....	18
1.2.1. The problem of defining moral dilemmas.....	18
1.2.2. The structure of moral dilemma	20
1.2.2.1. Objective elements of the structure of a dilemma	20
1.2.2.1.1. Disjunction of options.....	20
1.2.2.1.2. Symmetry of options.....	21
1.2.2.1.3. Moral conflict and harming	22
1.2.2.2. Subjective elements of the structure of a dilemma.....	24
1.2.2.2.1. Difficulty of choice	24
1.2.2.2.2. Moral residue	25
1.2.2.2.3. Guilt and dirty hands	27
1.3. Other practical problems	28
1.3.1. Conflict of conscience.....	29
1.3.2. Legal dilemma, or the problem of subjection to law	30
1.3.3. The problem of the application of law	31
1.3.4. The problem of interpretation	32
1.3.5. Conflict of values when they can be balanced by hierarchisation or optimisation.....	33
1.3.6. Conflict of roles.....	34
1.3.7. Subjectively hard choice.....	35
1.3.8. Epistemic dilemma	35
1.4. Conclusions	36

Chapter 2. Lawyers’ and Judges’ Deontological Dilemmas (Paweł Skuczyński)	39
2.1. Importance of institutions and lawyers’ and judges’ moral dilemmas	39
2.1.1. Role-duties and relation-obligations as institutionalised ought .	41
2.1.2. Institutionalised ought as exclusionary reasons.....	44
2.1.3. Institutionalised ought as professional value.....	50
2.2. Types of professional legal dilemmas.....	57
2.2.1. First dilemma: professional duty vs. professional duty.....	58
2.2.2. Second dilemma: professional duty vs. professional obligation ..	66
2.2.3. Third dilemma: professional obligation vs. professional obligation.....	75
2.2.4. Forth dilemma: professional obligation vs. professional ideal....	83
Chapter 3. Lawyers’ and Judges’ Axiological Dilemmas (Marcin Pieniążek)	93
3.1. Introduction	93
3.2. Can a lawyer or a judge reject the existence of values? The “anti-axiological” perspective.....	94
3.2.1. The extreme anti-axiological position	95
3.2.2. The moderate anti-axiological position.....	98
3.3. The “pro-axiological” perspectives and their inner differentiations. Seven dilemmas of a lawyer or a judge.....	99
3.4. First dilemma: a value’s <i>modus existendi</i> . Objective or subjective values?.....	100
3.4.1. Axiological objectivism (absolutism).....	100
3.4.2. Axiological subjectivism (relativism).....	102
3.4.3. “Cross trends”.....	103
3.4.4. The lawyer or the judge and the <i>modus existendi</i> of values.....	104
3.5. Second dilemma: the dispute considering the cognition of values. Cognitivism or non-cognitivism?.....	104
3.6. An illustration of meta-axiological dilemmas: the constitutional value theory of Z. Ziemiński.....	106
3.7. Third dilemma: substantive or procedural values?.....	107
3.7.1. Substantive theories of values.....	107
3.7.2. Procedural theories of values.....	109
3.7.3. The lawyer or the judge and substantive and procedural values ..	110
3.8. Fourth dilemma: values towards norms – generic or derivative?.....	111
3.8.1. “Thinking in accordance with norm” and “thinking in accordance with values”	111
3.8.2. Are values necessary in a normative system of law?	113

Table of Contents

3.9. Fifth dilemma: what is the bond between values and a normative system of law?	114
3.10. Sixth dilemma: what is the lawyer's or the judge's <i>universum</i> of professionally significant values?	116
3.10.1. The scope of the axiological basics of law	116
3.10.2. Constitutional values as an axiological basis in the view of Z. Ziemiński	118
3.10.3. From the "axiological basis of law" towards the "axiological basis of legal and judicial ethics"	120
3.10.4. Lawyers' and judges' ethical-professional values and their variability	121
3.10.4.1. The scope of the axiological basis of legal and judicial ethics	121
3.10.4.2. Axiological diversification in the public and private law	123
3.10.4.3. The lawyer and profit	125
3.10.5. Types of possible dilemmas	126
3.10.6. Cognition of <i>universum</i> of professionally significant values. Remarks concerning the axiological consciousness of a lawyer or a judge	127
3.11. Seventh dilemma: can values in a lawyers' or a judges' axiological universe be hierarchised? The commensurability and the disparity of values	128
3.12. Summary	130
Chapter 4. Lawyers' and Judges' Responsibility Dilemmas (<i>Przemysław Kaczmarek</i>)	133
4.1. Introduction: which and whose responsibility?	133
4.2. Two positions of responsibility in ethical discourse	135
4.2.1. Preliminary remarks	135
4.2.2. Responsibility as an ontological-ethical category	135
4.2.2.1. Ontologisation of responsibility	136
4.2.2.2. Responsibility as an ethical category	140
4.2.3. Responsibility as a transcendental-pragmatic category	142
4.2.3.1. The concept of communication community	142
4.2.3.2. Responsibility of the communication community	143
4.3. Moral responsibility in legal and judicial ethics: three choices' dilemmas	145
4.3.1. Preliminary remarks	145
4.3.2. First dilemma: responsibility in the positivistic and communicative concept of law	146

Table of Contents

4.3.3. Second dilemma: retrospective and prospective responsibility of role	150
4.3.4. Third dilemma: organisational and personal responsibility	155
4.3.5. The problem of escaping responsibility in the three moral dilemmas	158
4.4. Moral responsibility as “a vaccine” for escaping responsibility in general?	161
Part II. Overview of Lawyers’ and Judges’ Moral Dilemmas	165
Chapter 5. Lawyers’ and Judges’ Dilemmas in Criminal Law (Paweł Skuczyński).....	167
5.1. Preliminary remarks.....	167
5.2. Dilemmas of a judge.....	170
5.2.1. Lack of moral certainty about the factual circumstances.....	170
5.2.2. Conviction about the wrongness of a regulation	171
5.2.3. Contradicting expert opinions	172
5.2.4. Delegation of a judge vs the principle of a panel’s immutability	173
5.2.5. Waiver of professional confidentiality	173
5.2.6. Pre-trial detention	174
5.2.7. Notice of defence lawyer’s error.....	175
5.2.8. Criticism of public authority.....	176
5.2.9. Moral revilement of the accused	177
5.3. Dilemmas of the prosecutor.....	178
5.3.1. Interrogation of a suspect.....	178
5.3.2. Grounds for bringing an indictment.....	179
5.3.3. Prosecutor’s objectivity in inquisitorial proceedings	180
5.3.4. Abandoning prosecution	181
5.3.5. False confession	182
5.3.6. The defendant’s motion for issuing a judgment of conviction ...	182
5.3.7. Demands in the degree of penalty	183
5.3.8. Appeal regarding the penalty	184
5.3.9. Refusal to execute the order of one’s supervisor.....	185
5.4. The advocate’s dilemmas.....	186
5.4.1. Accepting a subjectively unjust case.....	186
5.4.2. Undertaking defence of a family member	187
5.4.3. Undertaking defence of one’s client.....	187
5.4.4. Revoking power of attorney vs barring by prescription.....	188
5.4.5. Undermining witness credibility	189
5.4.6. Disclosing an alibi against a client’s will	190

Table of Contents

5.4.7.	Revealing proof of guilt against the client	191
5.4.8.	Using false information obtained from the client.....	192
5.4.9.	Failure to appear at trial	192
5.4.10.	Not lodging an unfounded legal remedy despite the client	193
5.4.11.	Disagreement with the defendant about a plea for judgment of conviction	194
5.4.12.	Accepting and conducting a political case	195
Chapter 6. Lawyers' and Judges' Dilemmas in Civil and Commercial Law (Sebastian Sykuna)		197
6.1.	Preliminary remarks.....	197
6.2.	Dilemmas of a judge.....	199
6.2.1.	Dissolution of a commercial company	199
6.2.2.	Partition of real estate in dissolving a partnership	199
6.2.3.	Dispute with insurer over amount of compensation	200
6.2.4.	A civil court bound by a conviction issued by a penal court	201
6.2.5.	Evidence preclusion	202
6.2.6.	Claim statement of a suitor	202
6.2.7.	Determining the after-effects of a traffic accident	203
6.2.8.	Hearing a party in civil proceedings	204
6.2.9.	The problem of the appellate court with evidence preclusion	204
6.2.10.	Establishing liability for damage	205
6.2.11.	Appointing a company liquidator to oversee liquidation of a partnership	205
6.2.12.	A partnership board member's liability.....	206
6.2.13.	Excessive length of time	207
6.2.14.	Contributory negligence.....	207
6.2.15.	Refusal of indemnity by the Social Insurance Institution (Polish ZUS)	208
6.2.16.	The court's problem with maintaining the arbitrator's role in the proceedings	209
6.2.17.	Remote agreement on the phone.....	210
6.3.	Dilemmas of the counsels	210
6.3.1.	Problem of witness reliability	210
6.3.2.	High compensation from one's own employer	211
6.3.3.	Conducting a related case.....	212
6.3.4.	Contradictory expert opinions.....	212
6.3.5.	Problem of insufficient proofs in a case.....	213
6.3.6.	Unfavourable settlement of an agreement	214
6.3.7.	Release of claims for accidents at work	214

Table of Contents

6.3.8.	Problem with fulfilling the client's will	215
6.3.9.	Extending the proceedings upon a client's request	216
6.3.10.	Conducting a case against another lawyer	217
6.3.11.	Interviewing a witness who was formerly counsel's client	217
6.3.12.	Undertaking a case for eviction of an elderly person	218
6.3.13.	Counsel's problem with a contestable action for the client.....	219
Chapter 7. Lawyers' and Judges' Dilemmas in Family and Guardianship Law (<i>Sebastian Sykuna</i>)		221
7.1.	Preliminary remarks.....	221
7.2.	Dilemmas of a judge.....	223
7.2.1.	In divorce cases on the decree of dissolution of marriage	223
7.2.1.1.	At-fault divorce.....	223
7.2.1.2.	Divorce decree against the worldview of the judge.....	224
7.2.1.3.	Evidentiary proceedings with the participation of children	224
7.2.1.4.	Admitting sexually scandalising evidence	225
7.2.1.5.	The problem of deficiency of evidence in ruling.....	226
7.2.1.6.	The court bound with the parties' claim	226
7.2.1.7.	Grounds for divorce.....	227
7.2.1.8.	Decree dissolving marriage	227
7.2.2.	In divorce cases concerning child arrangements	228
7.2.2.1.	Contact and residence order	228
7.2.2.2.	Separating siblings in effect of their parents' divorce.....	229
7.2.2.3.	Child's residence after divorce of their parents	229
7.2.2.4.	The problem of an unwanted child after divorce.....	230
7.3.	Dilemmas of a judge in non-divorce cases but concerning parental authority, custody and alimony.....	231
7.3.1.	Problem with parental authority	231
7.3.2.	Grandparents raising a child	231
7.3.3.	Increasing alimony	232
7.3.4.	Financial penalty for failing in duties	233
7.3.5.	Granting contact with a child after interruption	233
7.4.	Dilemmas of the counsels in cases concerning the establishment of paternity, parental authority, custody of a child and alimony.....	234
7.4.1.	Summoning children as witnesses.....	234
7.4.2.	Hearing children as witnesses	235
7.4.3.	Problem with a false witness.....	236
7.4.4.	Presenting an unreliable witness.....	236
7.4.5.	Combining divorce with partition of joint property	237

Table of Contents

7.4.6.	Settling out of court about property	238
7.4.7.	Combination of criminal proceedings with a divorce case	239
7.4.8.	Refusal of legal help by a lawyer	239
7.4.9.	Counsel in respect of divulging a crime committed by the husband in divorce proceedings	240
7.5.	Dilemmas of the counsels in cases other than divorce but concerning the establishment of paternity, parental authority, custody of a child, alimony, etc.	241
7.5.1.	Counsel presenting facts in court	241
7.5.2.	Pedagogical considerations in juvenile proceedings.....	242
7.5.3.	Counsel accepting case	242
7.5.4.	Action for an immoral client	243
Chapter 8. Lawyers' and Judges' Dilemmas in Employment Law and Social Insolvency Law (<i>Paweł Łabieniec</i>)		245
8.1.	Preliminary remarks.....	245
8.2.	Court of Labour dilemmas.....	247
8.2.1.	Assessment of compliance with law of dismissal on disciplinary grounds vs the primacy of substantive precondition over formal conditions.....	247
8.2.2.	Dismissal of a distinguished worker on disciplinary grounds.....	248
8.2.3.	Referring employees to training raising their qualifications vs the no discrimination rule.....	249
8.2.4.	Employer's failing in their duty to pay remuneration on time vs the employee's duty of loyalty to the employer.....	250
8.2.5.	Employer demanding from candidate for work a certificate stating she is not pregnant vs discrimination due to sex	251
8.2.6.	Hazardous work conditions vs the duty of an employee to fulfil their supervisor's orders	252
8.2.7.	Dismissing a lawyer on disciplinary grounds for their allowing a conflict of interest.....	253
8.2.8.	Refusal to grant the right to benefit in respect of an accident at work to a priest providing religious service beyond the structures of religious associations.....	254
8.2.9.	Reverse discrimination in staff-cuts.....	255
8.2.10.	Dismissal from work of a doctor who exercised the conscience clause.....	256
8.2.11.	Refusal by an employee to perform orders that contradict their moral and religious convictions.....	257
8.3.	Dilemmas of a legal advisor	259

Table of Contents

8.3.1.	Problem of loyalty towards an employer in a situation of conflict between partners in the partnership employing a lawyer	259
8.3.2.	Dismissal of an employee shortly before the start of the termination protection period.....	260
8.3.3.	Employer's order to a legal advisor, being the employee to represent the employer, in proceedings against a lawyer to whom the advisor owes special gratitude	260
8.3.4.	Fulfilling the employer's orders leads a legal advisor into a conflict of interests	261
8.3.5.	Obligation to maintain professional confidentiality vs defence against unjustified termination of employment agreement	262
8.3.6.	A legal advisor faced with being positioned within a company in a manner not compliant with the Act.....	262
8.4.	Dilemmas of an employer	263
8.4.1.	Dismissing an employee who is an HIV carrier on demand of the majority of the staff	263
8.4.2.	Protection against dismissal of a pregnant worker vs the requirement for a catechist to have <i>Missio Canonica</i>	264
8.4.3.	Replacement of an employment agreement with a civil law agreement	265
8.4.4.	Ban on disclosing an employee's wages vs prohibition of wage discrimination	266
8.4.5.	Dismissal on disciplinary grounds of an outstanding specialist doctor who sexually harassed colleagues	266
8.5.	Dilemmas of an employee	268
8.5.1.	The limits of an employee's loyalty to their employer	268
8.5.2.	The limits of an employee's loyalty to their employer	268
8.5.3.	An employee informing an employer about colleagues in exchange for a promise of not being dismissed	269
8.5.4.	Executing an employer's orders vs sticking to the rules of professed religion	270
8.6.	Dilemmas of an inspector of the National Employment Inspectorate.....	271
8.6.1.	Employer's liability for failing to execute salary payment on time in a situation of lack of sufficient financial means for covering liabilities to all creditors.....	271
8.6.2.	Depriving an employer of sickness benefit for the whole period of incapacity to work as a sanction for performing at that time some administrative activities related to the functioning of their business.....	272

Table of Contents

8.6.3.	Fictive employment of close people in order to fraudulently claim maternity benefit.....	273
8.7.	Dilemmas of a court enforcement officer	273
8.7.1.	Protection of remuneration for work in execution proceedings vs attachment of a bank account	273
Chapter 9. Lawyers' and Judges' Dilemmas in Constitutional Law (Krzysztof J. Kaleta)		275
9.1.	Preliminary remarks	275
9.2.	Judges of the constitutional court	279
9.2.1.	Deciding on a clash of fundamental rights.....	279
9.2.2.	The necessity to balance private and public interest.....	280
9.2.3.	The necessity to consider factual circumstances in adjudication	282
9.2.4.	Capacity to decide on the legal basis of own actions	283
9.2.5.	Constitutional law versus European law – the limits of pro-European interpretation of the constitution	284
9.2.6.	Deciding on the accessibility of legal protection before constitutional court	287
9.2.7.	Independence of the judiciary versus personal opinions of a judge	288
9.2.8.	Impartiality and recusal of a judge	289
9.2.9.	Attaching a dissenting opinion	290
9.2.10.	Participation of a judge in public debate. Criticism of other authorities	291
9.2.11.	The limits of institutional self-defence in relation to extra-legal means of action	292
9.2.12.	The limits of institutional self-defence versus subjection of a constitutional judge to a statute	294
9.3.	Judges of common and administrative courts	297
9.3.1.	A judge's conscience versus subjection to statute	297
9.3.2.	Applying unconstitutional law by a judge of an administrative court.....	298
9.3.3.	Independence of the judiciary versus interpretative judgments of the constitutional court.....	299
9.3.4.	Transfer of a common court judge to executive branch versus separation of powers	301
9.3.5.	Admissibility of judicial review	302
9.4.	Central government	304
9.4.1.	Repeal of the constitutional court's judgment by parliament	304
9.4.2.	President as the guardian of the Constitution	305

Table of Contents

9.4.3. Using presidential prerogatives in the domain of judiciary branch	306
9.4.4. Status of the prosecutor in a democratic state of law and participation of a prosecutor in proceedings before the constitutional court	308
9.5. Civil Servants	310
9.5.1. Refusal to execute an official order regarded as illegal	310
9.5.2. Moral convictions of an official versus religious neutrality of the state	311
9.6. Legal experts in relations with public authorities	312
9.6.1. Assessment of bills in the legislative process	312
9.6.2. The role of a legal expert in reaching political compromise within the process of law-making.....	314
9.6.3. Academic activity of an expert versus working for public authorities and the right to criticize them	315
9.6.4. Limits of a lawyer’s engagement in strategic litigation	316
9.6.5. Transfer of an expert from public to private sector – “the revolving door problem”	317
9.6.6. Transfer of an expert from the private to public sector.....	319
9.6.7. The ethics of a legal adviser in the public sector	320
Bibliography	323